

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## S.1 Introduction

As part of the base closure and disposal process for Naval Station (NAVSTA) Brooklyn, New York, the Department of the Navy (DoN) has conducted historical documentation on the Naval Hospital Cemetery. NAVSTA Brooklyn covers approximately 28.8 government-owned acres (11.7 hectares), and is largely the area occupied by the former Naval Hospital that was decommissioned in 1948. The Naval Hospital Cemetery, which occupies about 1.7 acres (0.7 hectares) of a cleared, grassy area in the eastern portion of the site, served as the official burial ground for the Naval Hospital from 1831 until the cemetery's closure in 1910. In 1926, the Navy disinterred burials from the Naval Hospital Cemetery and reinterred them in Cypress Hills National Cemetery, also in Brooklyn.

During the base closure and disposal process, the Navy was made aware of community and civic concerns regarding the possibility of burials remaining in the Naval Hospital Cemetery. In 1991, archaeological research had confirmed the presence of an African burial ground in Manhattan; this incident, along with concerns of the local African-American community and others that any remains at the Naval Hospital Cemetery might be of persons of African descent, prompted questions regarding the racial makeup of the buried population.

Prior to the present study, the Navy had conducted three cultural resource evaluations of the cemetery, as follows:

- The first to be completed provided an initial historic background and concluded that the cemetery had been disturbed and had a low potential for archaeological sensitivity;
- The second determined that although there was no African burial ground present on the site, further studies should be performed to address issues such as discrepancies in burial records; and
- These studies ultimately led to a third evaluation, a field survey using ground-penetrating radar (GPR). This survey, conducted in July 1997, resulted in the discovery of a possibly intact burial.

In order to more fully understand the nature and magnitude of the issues surrounding the cemetery, the Navy subsequently undertook this study, *State of the Research, Naval Hospital Cemetery Historical Documentation, Naval Station Brooklyn, New York*, in order to determine, to the greatest extent possible, accurate information such as the number, name, and rank/rate of any burials at the cemetery that were not documented as being removed.

## S.2 The Naval Hospital Cemetery

The Naval Hospital Cemetery was established during the late 1820s or early 1830s, as it was customary in the 19th century for hospitals to have an associated cemetery. For almost 80 years, from 1831 to 1910, members of the military service and their dependents who died at the Brooklyn Naval Hospital and other locations, including many Naval vessels, were buried in the cemetery. Reports suggest that by 1881 as many as 2,000 burials had occurred at the Naval Hospital Cemetery. The present study documented 1,504 burials during the 80-year period, although records were missing for the last 16 years that the cemetery was active.

In 1910, with little room remaining for additional burials, the Naval Hospital Cemetery was closed. In 1926 the Navy disinterred remains from the Naval Hospital Cemetery and reinterred them at Cypress Hills National Cemetery. During the two-month-long disinterment and reburial process, 987 individuals were documented as being relocated.

---

## S.3 Prior and Current Research on the Naval Hospital Cemetery

Four cultural resource evaluations of NAVSTA Brooklyn and the Naval Hospital Cemetery, including the present study, have been carried out by the Navy. These surveys and their relevant conclusions are as follows:

- *Cultural Resources Survey for Base Closure and Realignment, Redevelopment and Reuse of Excess Property at Naval Station New York* (US Navy, 1994)

This 1994 survey of the NAVSTA Brooklyn site was conducted as a follow-up to the cultural resource appendix of the Navy's 1990 environmental assessment of the station. It provided a characterization of NAVSTA Brooklyn's archaeological sensitivity, and identified the Naval Hospital Cemetery as having a low archaeological sensitivity. This conclusion was based upon the determination that the landscape modifications in this area had, over time, significantly impacted any burials that may not have been removed. These impacts included the installation of gutters, catch basins, underground oil tanks, tile drains, a tennis court, and a paved road. This survey cited a report stating that 2,000 burials had taken place by the 1880s and raised the possibility that an earlier family burial ground was located on-site.

- *Archaeological Evaluation (Stage 1A Documentary Study) Former Naval Station (NAVSTA) New York Navy Yard Annex Site* (US Navy, 1997a)

This 1997 survey focused more specifically on the potential archaeological sensitivity of the Naval Hospital and cemetery. Based on consideration of newly located primary

sources, research for the *Archaeological Evaluation* presented a revised archaeological sensitivity assessment of NAVSTA Brooklyn. This reevaluation determined that the Naval Hospital Cemetery was not an African burial ground, but was the resting place of servicemen (of whom some were of African descent), their family members, and civilians. The report concluded that there was no earlier family burial ground on-site. It also concluded that some burials may not have been disinterred in 1926 and that the cemetery was likely to contain both fragmentary human bone and possibly disturbed burials (US Navy, 1997a). The 1997 report suggested that the cemetery had a high archaeological sensitivity and recommended GPR to further assess the cemetery.

- *Ground-Penetrating Radar Evaluation, Navy-Retained Section (former) Brooklyn Navy Yard* (US Navy, 1997b)

In 1997 the Navy conducted a limited GPR survey at the Naval Hospital Cemetery. Analysis of the GPR readings identified five areas with subsurface anomalies. The subsequent ground-proofing exposed filled shaft features, small quantities of fragmentary human bone, and evidence of decayed coffins, and led to the discovery of a possibly intact human skeleton buried at a shallow depth.

The findings of the GPR survey indicated that the documentary record concerning interments at the cemetery needed to be better understood in order to manage this resource. The Navy then initiated the research presented here.

- *State of the Research, Naval Hospital Cemetery Historical Documentation, Naval Station Brooklyn, New York*

The present study builds upon the research conducted during the three prior studies. Research regarding burials encountered discrepancies in the number of burials and disinterments that took place at the cemetery, as well as missing, incomplete, and contradictory information. Despite these discrepancies, this study succeeded in identifying 517 burials not documented as removed from the Naval Hospital Cemetery during the 1926 disinterment. In addition, it further develops the history of the Naval Hospital Cemetery, examines military burial practices in general, and researches the Navy's legal obligations regarding the cemetery.

A chronicle of the major research findings, and cemetery-related conclusions, of these four studies is presented in Figure S-1 (Chronicle of US Navy Research on the Naval Hospital Cemetery).

## S.4 Research Goals and Survey Methods

The research goals of the Navy's most recent effort, listed in order of their presentation in the *State of the Research* report, are as follows:

- (1) Examine military burial practices and regulations in the 19th and early 20th centuries to establish a procedural context for interments and disinterments at the Naval Hospital Cemetery;
- (2) Research modern federal, state, and local laws relating to cemeteries, cemetery maintenance, and disinterments;
- (3) Establish the historic context for interments and disinterments at the Naval Hospital Cemetery; and
- (4) Identify the number, name, rank/rate, and other information related to burials not documented as being removed and determine, to the greatest degree possible, why some burials were never documented as removed.

Accomplishing the first three research goals entailed conducting extensive documentary research and contacting individuals with expertise in relevant fields. This documentary research examined both primary and secondary sources. Many archives, museums, libraries, and other repositories were visited or contacted during this portion of the research effort.

In order to accomplish the fourth goal, 19th- and early 20th-century documentation regarding deaths at the Naval Hospital, burials and disinterments at the Naval Hospital Cemetery, and reinterments at Cypress Hills National Cemetery were examined. Determination of the number and identity of burials not documented as being removed involved comparing two groups of names:

- Those documented as being buried at the Naval Hospital Cemetery; and
- Those documented as being disinterred from the cemetery in 1926.

This comparison identified 517 burials at the Naval Hospital Cemetery that are not documented as being disinterred. Two main sources identified this information: (1) the *Register of Deaths and of Burial Plots, 1831 to 1894*; and (2) the revised *1927 Index of Remains Removed from the Naval Hospital Cemetery*. A primary source of information regarding burials at the Naval Hospital Cemetery between 1894 and 1910 (when the cemetery was officially closed), such as a register of deaths and burials, was not located. Therefore, information on burials during those years is limited to the list of the disinterred.

Additional sources, including hospital ledgers, grave locators, archival files, correspondence, and death certificates of Navy personnel who died outside the hospital but were buried in the Naval Hospital Cemetery were reviewed to obtain additional information. Comparison of the various resources suggested those that were most reliable and, therefore, most valuable. Based on this comparison, an attempt was made to correct information found in the two sources noted above. This corrected information is presented in Appendices A and B of this report.

Determining why burials were not documented as having been removed involved synthesis of the collected information and theorizing based on the research. Historic documentation of the cemetery is incomplete, and the records that exist were often found to be inconsistent. As research progressed, it became clear that there may never be definitive answers to some outstanding questions. All avenues of inquiry and the subsequent results are documented in this report and, where possible, conclusions have been made.

---

## **S.5 History of Military Burial Practice**

The events at the Naval Hospital Cemetery during the 19th and early 20th centuries did not occur in isolation, but were directly related to the conflicts facing the US military at large and the practices and procedures in effect regarding graves registration. The 1926 disinterments were influenced by the graves customs, practices, and legislation of the military in general.

The burial practices of the US military have gradually been established, and formalized through legislation, over the past 200 years. Legislation regarding burial practices was generally passed during periods of military conflict, times when the number of military casualties were increasing dramatically. The first concerted effort by the military towards establishing formalized procedures for the treatment of war casualties occurred in 1861, at the beginning of the Civil War. Despite new procedures, a very high percentage of military casualties during the Civil War years were never documented. Military graves registration attained much of its present-day character during the years leading up to and following World War I (1912 to 1924).

---

## **S.6 Modern Legal Summary**

While the majority of the laws and regulations reviewed during this research are not directly relevant to the Naval Hospital Cemetery, they are related to cultural resource or cemetery maintenance issues. For example, the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act concerns the protection of Native American graves, while the only possibly Native American interment was disinterred from the Naval Hospital Cemetery and transferred to Cypress Hills National Cemetery in 1926 (US Navy, 1997a). In addition, state and local cultural resource laws are not directly applicable since this is a federal action being directed by the Department of the Navy. The only New York State laws dealing

specifically with cemetery maintenance are governed by the New York State Cemetery Board and only concern “cemetery corporations,” not-for-profit corporations organized for the disposal or burial of the deceased.

The National Historic Preservation Act, Executive Order No. 11593 – Protection and Enhancement of Cultural Environment, and the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) do apply to the Naval Hospital Cemetery, and it is in accordance with these acts that the Navy has conducted the present study and the three prior studies discussed earlier. The Navy’s Real Estate Procedure Manual, 38 USC Sections 2404 and 2405, and 10 USC Section 1488 apply to the removal of remains from discontinued cemeteries located on military reservations. This manual and these laws would only apply to the Naval Hospital Cemetery should action be taken involving the removal of any burials from the cemetery.

---

## **S.7 Burials Not Documented as Removed**

The Navy’s documentary research on the Naval Hospital Cemetery found statements by commanding officers of the Brooklyn Naval Hospital that describe recurring problems at the cemetery, including conflicting accounts of the number of burials; poorly preserved, missing, and vandalized wooden grave markers; grave markers with illegible inscriptions; and undocumented burials. The discrepancy between the number of documented burials and the number of documented disinterments is one of the primary issues discussed in this report. These burials are referred to as *burials not documented as removed*.

---

### **S.7.1 Burial Information**

The primary source of information on burials in the cemetery is the *Register of Deaths and of Burial Plots, 1831 to 1894* (RD, 1831-1894). This register documents the burial of 1,351 individuals at the Naval Hospital Cemetery during its first 64 years of use. Some were only temporarily buried or held in a vault, and removed prior to 1926. The burial register for the 16-year period from 1894 to 1910 could not be located. The *Alphabetical Index of Remains Removed from the US Naval Hospital Cemetery* (1927 Index) lists 987 individuals disinterred from the cemetery in 1926 with dates of death spanning from 1831 to 1910 (when the cemetery was closed).

Comparison of these two and other sources mentioned throughout this document revealed that during its approximately eight decades of operation, a minimum of 1,717 burials occurred in the Naval Hospital Cemetery. At least 213 of these burials were removed by friends or family soon after they were buried or their bodies held in a vault. As mentioned above, in 1926, 16 years after the cemetery was officially closed, 987 burials were disinterred. A comparison of the number removed and the 1,504 known burials indicates that at least 517 were not documented as removed.

Table S-1 presents a numerical breakdown of this burial information arranged by date of death. The two time periods in this table are:

- (1) October 20, 1831 (the earliest documented burial) to October 5, 1894 (the last recorded burial in the RD, 1831-1894). Information about burials in the first category was gathered primarily from the RD, 1831-1894; and
- (2) October 6, 1894 to 1910 (when the cemetery closed). Information about later burials was based on dates of death listed in the 1927 Index.

The 366 burials shown in Table S-1 that occurred after 1894 include 159 burials that have no listed date of death in the 1927 Index. Since these names do not appear in the comprehensive 1831 to 1894 burial register, it is assumed that they occurred during this time period.

The names and dates of death of the 517 burials not documented as removed from the cemetery are listed alphabetically in Table S-2. Appendix A of this report provides an alphabetical listing with the name, rank/rate, and date of death for the known burial population of 1,504 individuals. Appendix B presents this same information chronologically by date of death. Burials that are not documented as removed are indicated in bold typeface. Information about individual burials that has been corrected through a comparison of the various sources is noted in the appendices under “remarks.”

---

### **S.7.2 Why Are Burials Not Documented as Removed?**

The identification of 517 burials not documented as removed from the Naval Hospital Cemetery, and the unknown number that may remain unidentified, prompts the question “why are so many burials not documented as removed?” Answering this question involves synthesis of the collected information and speculation where definitive data are not available.

Documents consulted during the research process contain numerous references to the poor condition of the cemetery and its grave markers and conflicting accounts of how many interments took place. Comparison of primary source materials, such as burial registers and disinterment lists, reveals misspellings, transcription errors, and missing or incomplete records. All these factors contribute to burials not being documented. Equally or even more important are the poor condition and/or non-

Table S-1

Naval Hospital Cemetery Burial Data

Status of Burial	Date of Death		Total
	Oct 20, 1831 - Oct 5, 1894	Oct 6, 1894 - 1910	
Buried or Held in Naval Hospital Cemetery <sup>1</sup>	1,351	366 <sup>45</sup>	1,717 <sup>5</sup>
Removed by Family or Friends Before 1926	(213) <sup>2</sup>	unknown	(213)
Subtotal	1,138	366 <sup>5</sup>	1,504 <sup>5</sup>
Disinterred in 1926	(622) <sup>3</sup>	(365) <sup>3</sup>	(987)
<b>Not Documented as Removed</b>	<b>516</b>	<b>1<sup>5</sup></b>	<b>517<sup>5</sup></b>
<p>Notes: <sup>1</sup>Source: RD, 1831-1894 and Blackwood Report (1926a). Some burials were only briefly held in a cemetery vault and then removed.  <sup>2</sup>Source: RD, 1831-1894.  <sup>3</sup>Source: 1927 Index.  <sup>4</sup>Includes only those with listed or surmised dates of death between Oct 6, 1894 and 1910 listed in the 1927 Index; no burial register for 1894-1910 was located to determine total burials from this period.  <sup>5</sup>Minimum number of individuals.                      Parentheses indicate burials documented as removed from the cemetery.</p>			

Table S-2

## List of Those Not Documented As Removed From Naval Hospital Cemetery

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>
Adams, Charles	06-23-68	Brown, Joseph	01-26-70	Crawford, James H.	05-15-41
Adams, Joseph	03-24-50	Brown, Robert	09-17-42	Crocker, Jas or Wm	09-25-46
Adger, Johnson	06-10-38	Brown, Robert	07-14-49	Cummings, John	07-11-52
Albert, John	06-20-54	Brown, William 1st	07-31-71	Cunell, Henry	03-12-65
Albert, Peter	09-29-48	Bryan, James	05-22-66	Cunningham, James	08-??-49
Allen, Thomas	04-10-71	Buchanan, John	07-19-67	Curley, James	01-06-54
Almond, William A.	06-19-48	Buchanan, William	05-01-58	Curran, John	12-03-48
Amour, James	09-26-33	Bullen, William	07-30-65	Curran?, James	09-09-70
Anderson, William	09-10-56	Bundy, Charles	04-23-48	Curtis, George	09-22-62
Anfevino, Lewis	05-19-52	Burgess, Samuel	06-08-48	Curtis, Henry	10-11-63
Antonio, Louis	01-07-42	Burke, James M.	04-01-94	Daggett, Richmond	03-13-71
Aquirrer, Theodore	07-05-55	Burns, James	1866	Dalzell?, Thomas	05-03-48
Archer, Thomas	03-20-70	Cade, John F.	02-01-38	Darrell, George	06-25-65
Armstrong, James	06-27-65	Calwell, Nathan	01-16-35	das Van Hoke,	08-25-66
Arnold, Bryon P.	03-26-65	Campbell, James A.	10-27-67	Amandus	
Asay, Yoshikazu	10-29-91	Campbell, John	07-13-65	Davidson, William	06-27-36
Barcondale, Henry	12-02-41	Cantwill, Patrick	09-28-47	Davis, Charles	09-19-45
Bareres?, Charles	08-29-70	Cappell, Jacob	01-06-61	Davis, John	11-17-63
Barker, John	12-22-36	Carlborn, Charles	02-21-50	Dawson, John H.	12-19-79
Barnes, John	07-04-42	Carlyslle, Samuel	08-16-65	Decrupp, August	08-27-60
Bartlett, Frank	02-12-91	Carpenter, John	03-15-66	Deemer, Samuel W.	1880-81
Becker/Baker, Isaac	02-18-79	Carr, Davis	05-02-70	Denham, -----	04-06-41
Bedding, Henry	05-29-43	Carson, James	06-04-34	Dickson, Lewis	05-15-63
Bell, Benj. H.	04-08-46	Casey, James	06-26-67	Dodge, C. H.	12-18-65
Bennett, Cornelius	01-09-48	Castello, Thomas	09-23-48	Donale, George	07-14-51
Benning, William	01-30-69	Charles, Edward	02-06-66	Donnelly, William	12-13-42
Bent, Daniel	01-30-65	Chase, Benjamin	02-20-38	Donovan, Richard	12-20-50
Bessi, John	03-05-52	Cheney, Moses	01-13-69	Douglass, Alex B.C.	02-04-67
Binton, John	02-25-65	Clark, -----	11-30-37	Douglass, Joseph	03-10-91
Blanchard, George W.	09-07-67	Clark, John	04-20-67	Douglass, Richard	04-20-51
Blank, Thomas	01-16-42	Clark, Joseph	07-31-52	Driscoll, Dennis	02-04-70
Bliss, Joel	06-23-47	Clayhon, Ralph	01-05-49	Dudley, John E.	06-07-59
Boardman, Robert A.	02-23-65	Clayton, Robert	01-07-57	Duffy, Francis	04-14-69
Boley, Thomas	07-26-65	Clifford/Cliffon,	04-15-65	Dugan, William	01-??-65
Bolton, George	05-19-66	George W.		Dunham, John	06-27-37
Bormeister, William	04-08-64	Clough, William N.	04-01-51	Dunhen, Lewis A.	07-30-52
Bover, Andrew I.	05-01-46	Clough, William R.	04-01-51	Dunn, Adam	12-31-60
Bows/Baus?(illegible),	05-08-69	Cochran, E. E.	06-24-60	Edmonds, Henry	08-11-52
Herman		Codding, Alfred	04-25-63	Edmonds, Henry	01-09-67
Boyer, Andrew	09-14-50	Coffee, Thomas	02-04-70	Edwards, Robert	03-03-42
Brady, James	11-10-85	Collins, Michael	07-17-72	Edwards, Thomas	01-29-65
Brasier, Francis	08-10-39	Conway, William	11-30-65	Edwards, Thomas	04-12-72
Breen, Thomas	10-30-65	Cook, Joseph	01-16-69	Eldrige, Charles	09-06-66
Brennan, George	02-02-98	Cooley, Emanuel	09-14-66	Ellingworth, Samuel	10-24-65
Briggs, William	02-22-51	Coombs, John	09-09-54	Elliott, George	08-08-66
Brinckerhoff, Isaac	09-28-74	Cooper, Charles	03-08-53	Ellis, John	05-21-69
Brockette, Matthew	10-14-66	Cooper, Henry	07-12-50	Ellison, Alenzo	05-01-65
Brown, Benjamin	03-22-54	Cooper, John S.	04-23-60	Fenton, Joseph	11-02-67
Brown, Charles	10-21-57	Cotter, James	01-05-49	Fleming, John	10-10-55
Brown, James	08-21-73	Cowie, Isaac John	12-??-66	Flemming, Thomas	08-16-69
Brown, James C.	10-09-64	Crampton, William	08-12-71	Forbes, William	08-03-45
Brown, John	07-17-35	Crane, Thomas	01-09-69	Ford, David	06-07-54

Table S-2 (continued)

List of Those Not Documented As Removed From Naval Hospital Cemetery

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>
Foster, James	07-09-68	Harrington, Stephen	03-04-58	Jones, Thomas D.	03-18-48
Fox, James R.	08-08-49	Harris, David	06-09-36	Kaldaw, Daniel	03-24-65
Fox, Robert	02-01-50	Harris, Henry	09-21-58	Kelly, Henry	10-11-46
Foyle, Alex	02-02-68	Harris, James	06-15-67	Kelly, James	03-24-35
Francis, Matthew	07-26-76	Harris, William	01-22-67	Kelly, John	11-03-43
Francisco, Philip	04-13-42	Harrison, John	04-10-65	Kelly, John J.	06-26-67
Franklyn, Charles	01-14-65	Hart, Francis	02-06-63	Kelly, William C.	06-05-43
Franklyn, John	07-14-66	Hart, Peter	09-05-49	Kelshaw, William	10-22-51
Franklyn, Samuel	08-03-67	Haviland, Joseph	05-18-66	Kennedy, William	09-03-56
Frazier, James	06-30-41	Hawkins, Enoch S.	04-29-61	King, John	04-21-63
Freeman, Andrew	06-??-51	Hayne, George	02-06-38	Klier, Frederick	06-06-54
Frost, John A.	10-20-42	Haywood, William	12-15-42	Knight, Mortimer	07-24-54
Frothingham, Fred A.	05-24-48	Hazeltine, Charles	01-30-35	Kremer, John	12-05-79
Fry, -----	12-07-50	Heath, James	10-19-65	Kumman, Dennis	07-18-40
Fryer, Jesse	06-11-78	Heckle, John	01-15-47	Lane, James H.	08-27-66
Furlong, Stephen	07-27-42	Hegan, George	08-03-68	Langden, Richard P.	07-02-48
Gallagher, James	07-25-66	Henes, Jacob	02-03-67	Lawrence, -----	1831-33
Gallagher, William	04-26-66	Henline, Simon P.	06-02-61	Lawrence, William	10-05-75
Gamble, William P.	09-04-38	Henry, Anton	03-16-65	Lawson, Zachirah	04-28-42
Gardiner, Alex.	09-14-48	Henry, William	06-04-69	Lawton, Frank	11-14-71
Gardner, John	03-20-70	Higgins, William	12-06-58	Laydecker, Claus	03-18-52
Geron, Charles L.	04-28-47	Hill, John	07-20-78	Lee, John	05-??-68
Gilbert, Charles	01-19-66	Hillman, Charles	11-25-64	Lee, John C.	08-15-42
Gibbons (Child)	07-21-49	Hoff, Henry	09-03-66	Lemmons, William	01-19-57
Gill, James	07-01-49	Hogan, Richard	01-24-91	Leonard, Cyrus	12-27-48
Glass, -----	01-02-39	Hogins, William	03-26-55	Leonard, William	12-30-71
Glebe, Henry	09-26-65	Holland, James	07-15-60	Lester, Daniel	01-02-65
Golden, Benjamin F.	1869	Holmes, William	03-02-49	Lewis, Edward	10-01-61
Gordan?, William	07-26-45	Holt, John	11-09-45	Lonagan, William	04-26-92
Gorens, William	12-24-60	Hopkins, George	07-05-39	Long, William	07-04-39
Gorkill, Henry D.	12-15-58	Hoseath, Olif	06-02-70	Lopez, Antonio	02-11-66
Gown, Charles	04-04-57	Hove, Robert E.	11-11-47	Loyd, Joseph	03-03-36
Gracey, John	10-29-71	Huey, Thomas	01-10-57	Lynch, Michael	06-14-76
Grady, Patrick	01-25-65	Hurst, John	12-07-67	Manes?, James	12-08-66
Green, Daniel	04-11-47	Huston, James F.	01-01-69	Manning, James	08-13-65
Green, Patrick	12-05-66	Hutchins, Thomas	09-25-36	Markey, William	02-19-41
Green, Peter	02-07-50	Imfaut, Stephen	12-07-49	Marnity, Lodovico	12-19-35
Greet, Joseph	10-24-68	Irvine, Charles	04-10-64	Martin, George	08-16-39
Griffin, Louis	01-31-66	Irving, John I.	06-11-47	Mason, John	1850
Groves, William	02-20-55	Jackson, Alex	12-23-54	Maudweek, Francis	02-20-51
Haffron, John	03-21-48	Jackson, Christian	12-16-34	Mayo, Charles	05-16-55
Haggerty, William	01-05-53	Jackson, Edward P.	07-24-66	McCarthy, Charles	07-01-44
Hall, Andrew	07-21-66	Jackson, Henry	02-09-35	McCormick, Daniel	08-13-39
Hall, Clem	03-26-64	Jacobs, William H.	02-22-67	McDermot, John	04-03-65
Hall, George	1834	Jansson, Frans Os---	12-07-90	McDonald, John	07-28-42
Hallbut, Joseph	08-31-49	Jenkins, Thomas	01-05-65	McGovern, John	08-21-75
Hamilton, Alex	03-21-42	Johnson, Harris	03-29-65	McGowan, Farrell	03-25-49
Hamilton, Eugene	06-10-71	Johnson, Stephen	03-12-53	McGregor, Archibald	11-13-63
Handley, William	08-15-65	Johnson, William 5th	12-22-48	McGuire, Bernard	09-03-66
Hanson, John	08-26-52	Johnson, William	07-21-49	McIntyre, Charles N.	08-25-49
Hanson, Matthias	02-03-65	Johnson, William	05-27-62	McIntyre, Peter	01-28-65
Hardy, David	02-27-65	Jonbidge, William	12-31-51	McKennon, Archibald	11-17-50
Harrigan, Jerry	01-09-71	Jones, George	08-04-70	McKeown, Nathaniel	07-21-52

Table S-2 (continued)

List of Those Not Documented As Removed From Naval Hospital Cemetery

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>
McLaughlin, James	09-16-68	Pruden, George N.	08-16-48	Smith, Alex.	06-08-50
McMane, John	06-18-47	Purgold, Henry G.	08-15-66	Smith, Allen	02-28-64
McManus, John	01-28-68	Quderon, Charles	02-19-74	Smith, Charles	05-15-62
McMaury, John	06-26-66	Ramos, Jose	10-26-60	Smith, Clinton	08-18-65
McNally, John	09-10-66	Ramsey, -----	04-??-66	Smith, George, 2nd	12-21-32
McQuillan, Hugh	02-25-65	Ramussen, Chris	06-29-66	Smith, George	06-30-48
McQuinn, Charles	05-01-46	Ranceplyn, Godfried	03-20-48	Smith, Henry	12-17-63
McSweeney, Dennis	04-02-93	Ray, John	02-06-69	Smith, Henry	09-20-65
Menendez, Ramon	10-27-60	Raynard, John	11-29-66	Smith, Jacob	07-31-66
Meredith, John	02-17-38	Reed?, Alex	09-11-84	Smith, James	07-04-55
Mielby(e), Peter	03-30-64	Reigart (Infant)	06-09-37	Smith, John	03-09-51
Miller, Henry	10-20-31	Reilly, Thomas	12-14-84	Smith, John	07-04-65
Miller, Henry	08-28-58	Reves, Alfred	01-24-69	Smith, John	02-19-65
Miller, John	06-15-55	Reynolds, John	11-05-62	Smith, John Henry	09-16-90
Miller, William	01-28-43	Richardson, James	09-10-45	Smith, Joseph	04-16-47
Mitchell, James	02-20?-43	Riley, Alex	01-23-68	Smith, Sidney	05-22-68
Mitchell, James	04-16-55	Riley (Child)	1839	Smith, Terrell	07-10-87
Monroe, Richard A.	05-07-34	Riley, Philip	07-05-50	Smith, William 2nd	12-26-44
Montgomery, James	03-13-50	Ritter, David	02-04-48	Smith, William	02-06-70
Morrison, John	06-28-51	Robbins, George W.	03-01-45	Smith, William	11-09-71
Murphy, Maurice	03-11-70	Robbins, George W.	07-23-66	South, William	04-01-66
Murphy, Patrick	02-27-70	Robbins, Nathaniel	10-17-65	Spicers, John	10-11-36
Myers, Edward	1849	Roberts, Francis	10-02-35	Staby?, James	06-11-44
Myers, Perry	06-26-65	Roberts, Joseph	1834	Stanton, Thomas	06-07-45
Nash, Daniel S.	02-17-65	Robertson, James	01-01-71	Steele, Harlin	04-26-65
Nelson, Neil	02-27-66	Robir, Antonio	05-27-65	Stephens, Henry	7-2-63
Nelson, Thomas	01-06-65	Rody, James	12-??-50	Stetson, Frank	01-27-65
Nelson, Thomas C.	04-07-52	Rogers, Charles E.	04-17-62	Steward, James P.	08-16-52
Newman, William	12-11-75	Rogers (Infant)	03-02-37	Stewart, Thomas	08-24-34
Nichols, Robert	03-06-42	Rourck, James	02-11-69	Stewart, Thomas	01-09-61
O'Hara, John	02-26-70	Roy, James	01-13-68	Stewart, William	02-10-66
O'Neil, Columbus	05-19-88	Royall, Leroy	12-26-45	Stocking, William	09-05-49
O'Neil, Joseph	04-02-93	Russell, George F.	01-06-67	Stockman, Henry	1847
Oltgenon?, Paul	12-10-68	Russell, William	05-17-45	Stryder, Charles	10-19-35
Omer, Augustus	07-09-53	Russell, William	05-31-65	Sturitt, James	1834
Parker, Andrew	01-02-80	Sands, Jesse	01-06-72	Sullivan, James	12-01-71
Parker, Samuel	02-04-39	Santile, William D.	07-13-46	Sullivan, William	01-24-69
Parsons, Thomas	10-20-57	Scandik, Peter	03-04-49	Swain, Eliakin	11-24-37
Patterson, John	04-21-58	Schmidt, William J.	05-22-70	Sykes, William	1834
Pearson, John	09-16-48	Schneider, John	03-01-58	Tagg, Charles	10-20-65
Peary, Alvin A.	03-20-51	Schofield, Charles	06-15-65	Tate, Samuel	02-04-69
Peck, John	11-17-61	Scott, Anthony	01-30-38	Taylor, Frank	06-02-69
Pendergrast, James	11-16-65	See, Patrick	04-28-65	Taylor, George	05-03-47
Peterson, John	10-19-47	Selden, Armishead	07-04-68	Taylor, John	01-23-51
Phelps, William C?.	12-04-43	Serynwiz, Joseph	08-10-57	Thompson, John	07-21-48
Phinney, Josiah	05-05-55	Shaw, John	01-29-52	Thompson, John	02-05-65
Pickley, Jonathan	05-23-58	Shields, Robert	02-03-67	Thompson, William	05-10-58
Porte/Poote?, Thomas	02-19-52	Siddens, William N.	03-12-58	Thompson, William	06-19-66
Powelson, Charles W.	03-30-93	Simmons, Alexander	09-19-66	Valetine, -----	1847
Pownall, John	02-04-69	Simpson, John H.	06-19-47	Van Horne, James	10-27-41
Pratt, Noah	01-30-65	Singan, John	06-09-55	Veller, Louis	05-29-65
Price, -----	04-15-40	Skebel, Thomas	12-11-63	Vixen, Thomas	09-29-57
Probst, Frederick	03-10-68	Skogland, John	08-14-85	Wade, -----	02-27-41

Table S-2 (continued)

List of Those Not Documented As Removed From Naval Hospital Cemetery

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of Death</u>
Wahlman, Christian	07-14-45	Wiley, Theodore	07-16-68	Wormell, C. L.	08-01-65
Waldron, R. Russell	10-30-46	Wilkie, George	02-27-35	Wright, William	01-22-69
Walker, John	09-13-34	Willard, Frederick	08-09-39	Yonts, Charles	09-07-45
Wallace, Thomas	1861	Willett, Marinus?	04-21-60	Young, Asa	06-24-64
Ward, Thomas H.	08-25-65	Willey, Collins	01-07-43	-----	06-30-38
Warren, Charles	09-02-68	Williams, Charles	05-29-64	-----	07-01?-39
Warren, George	03-17-68	Williams, John 2nd	06-17-49	-----	03-08-41
Watkins, -----	Sept 40	Williams, John	02-24-65	-----	02-13-42
Watson, Thomas	01-21-64	Williams, John	02-15-72	-----	08-??-49
Watts, John W.	01-19-69	Williams, Thomas	05-28-60	-----	01-22-51
Weed, Henry	01-19-44	Williams, William	10-09-46	-----	04-20-51
Wells, William	03-??-68	Willis, Charles	03-04-35	-----	04-25-63
Wentworth, James	02-06-35	Wilson, Charles	03-06-65	-----	1863-64
White, Henry	05-28-66	Wilson, James	07-14-45	-----	08-12-64
White, Oliver A.	10-23-48	Woodruff, Ned	02-06-63		
White, William H.	02-09-68	Woodruff, Richard	06-17-48		

----- No name listed in burial register  
 ? Questionable spelling or accuracy

existence of grave markers, lack of accurate plot plans, and clerical errors, as further discussed below:

- **Missing Grave Markers**

The cemetery's grave markers, particularly before the end of the Civil War, were most often wooden headboards and less often iron markers. The researched documents frequently cite decomposition of grave markers as a problem at the Naval Hospital Cemetery, as well as at military cemeteries in general during the 19th century. The poor preservation of headboards clearly led to many burials at the Naval Hospital Cemetery becoming unmarked. The disinterment process appears to have occurred without consideration of these unmarked burials.

- **Lack of Accurate Plot Plans**

The index to the 1831-1894 register includes a plan number for most, but not all, recorded burials, but no plan map has been found that locates these graves. The 1926 exhumations appear to have been based on a "complete new plan of the ... graves" made in the 1920s in preparation for the disinterment. Such a plan would likely have been drawn from existing cemetery conditions which, as reported even in 1889, did not reflect the total burial population. Since the 1926 disinterment process accounted for only 987 burials, that plan appears not to have considered unmarked graves.

- **Clerical Errors**

Record-keeping and transcription errors, and the logistical complexity associated with the cemetery's massive exhumation (during which, for over a month, 30 to 40 burials per day were removed), may have resulted in inaccurate disinterment documentation. Even before the exhumations occurred, clerical errors had resulted in confusion over the number and identity of burials. Analysis of the new grave numbers assigned between 1923 and 1924 in preparation for the removal indicated that at least eight were duplicates. It is possible that such clerical errors resulted in some burials being removed without being properly documented.

---

### **S.7.3 Examination of Burials Not Documented as Removed Over Time**

Examination of the number of burials per year and the number of burials not documented as removed per year between 1831 and 1894, when the most accurate data are available, led to the identification of two general patterns:

- (1) Burials that occurred from late 1831 to 1871, the first 40 years of the cemetery's 80-year operation, were much less likely to be documented as removed than those that occurred later (93 percent of the 517 burials not documented as removed occurred before 1871); and
- (2) There are two time periods when the greatest number of burials occurred that were not documented as removed – during and just after the Mexican War, from 1847 to 1849 (about 56, or 11 percent), and during and just after the Civil War, from 1863 to 1869 (about 178, or 34 percent); these were the two periods in the 19th century when the Naval Hospital and its cemetery were most active.

These patterns indicate that burials not documented as removed were a result of both the age of the burials and the number of burials that took place during a particular year. A notable exception to these trends occurred during 1863 and 1864, when a total of 214 individuals were buried at the Naval Hospital Cemetery. These two years were the most active ones of the 19th century with respect to burials, and yet only 24, or 11 percent, of these burials are not documented as being removed. This is in contrast to the post-Civil War years (from 1866 to 1871) when many fewer burials took place but the total burials not documented as removed were over 90 percent.

---

#### **S.7.4 Are Burials Still Present at the Naval Hospital Cemetery?**

The number of burials not documented as removed raises a related question: are burials still present at the Naval Hospital Cemetery? Research identified several factors that would impact the present state of burials not documented as removed:

- The natural deterioration of human bone over time;
- The damp, poorly drained condition of the cemetery during the 19th century;
- The undocumented removal of burials; and
- Ground disturbances over time.

Remaining burials would likely be disturbed and poorly preserved. Given the lack of an accurate plot plan and the poor preservation, it is unlikely that the identity of any remaining individual burials could be determined.

The limited excavations that took place during the ground-proofing conducted in association with the Navy's 1997 GPR evaluation both support and contradict this conclusion. Four of the five excavated trenches yielded fragments of highly deteriorated coffin wood (in one instance, only a staining in the soil) and fragmentary, poorly preserved human bone. These pieces of human bone and coffin wood attest to both poor preservation and subsequent ground disturbance. However, a single, possibly intact skeleton was also discovered during these limited excavations. This burial was

encountered at a depth of 15 to 19 inches (38 to 48 centimeters) below the ground surface without any associated coffin wood. Since this burial was located in the western portion of the cemetery, it is possible that the burial's higher elevation contributed to its preservation.

---

### **S.7.5 Demographics of Burials Not Documented as Removed**

An attempt was made to determine the demographic makeup of burials not documented as removed, including information such as military rank/rate and affiliation, country of origin, and race. The research also attempted to identify any Medal of Honor recipients among the burials not documented as removed. These findings are summarized briefly below.

Of the 517 burials not documented as removed, 405 were identified as Sailors (two of them in the Spanish Navy) and 86 were Marines. Four were children or infants, three were civilians (including one blacksmith), and 19 lacked affiliations. Not surprisingly, most of the ranked US Sailors were Seamen (147), Ordinary Seamen (80), or Landsmen (77). The 99 remaining American Sailors held 40 different ranks or rates ranging from cook to captain. Marines were mainly listed solely as "Marine" (48), but at least 19 were Privates. The remaining 19 held the rank of Corporal (7), Sergeant (8), Lieutenant (3), and Captain (1).

Country of origin, or place of birth, was found for some of the burials not documented as removed, mainly those listed in hospital patient registers (RP, 1812-1862; RP, 1862-1868; and RP, 1868-1874). Of the approximately 300 names with this information, 175 were from the US and the rest were from countries and regions around the globe.

Some of the documents identify burials with terms such as "Negro," "Colored," and "Mulatto," sometimes including physical descriptions such as "wool" or "wooly" hair and dark or black skin and eyes. Such information was interpreted as referring to burials of African descent. A total of 45 burials that may have been of African descent were identified among the 517 not documented as removed. The most commonly used identifier for these burials was "Negro," with 30 entries. One of the burials identified as "Negro" in the hospital burial register (RD, 1831-1894), is described in another list as having a light complexion, brown hair, and hazel eyes (RP, 1862-1868). Less frequent entries included "Colored" or "Coloured" (five entries), "Black" (three entries), and "Mulatto" (four entries). The terms "ne" (possibly an abbreviation for "Negro") and "Col'd" and "Col" (assumed to be abbreviations for "Colored"), were entered for one burial each. Given the incomplete records and the subjective nature of the information, these numbers may not represent the entire population of burials of African descent among the 517 not documented as removed.

No Medal of Honor recipients were identified among the burials not documented as removed, although two of those disinterred from the Naval Hospital Cemetery in 1926 did receive this medal, and one of them was a two-time honoree.